

CONTENTS

PREFACE	ix
SECTION 1 TORT LIABILITY OF TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENTS, OFFICIALS, AND EMPLOYEES	1-1
A. IMMUNITY OF THE SOVEREIGN TO TORT SUITS	1-3
A.1. Introduction—Bases for Tort Liability	1-3
A.2. Historical Evolution of Governmental Immunity to Suit in Tort	1-4
A.3. Sovereign Immunity in Contrast to Governmental Immunity	1-4
A.4. Liability for Proprietary as Distinguished from Governmental Functions	1-5
B. JUDICIAL AND LEGISLATIVE WAIVER OF SOVEREIGN IMMUNITY	1-6
B.1. Introduction	1-6
B.2. Trend Towards Governmental Responsibility	1-6
B.3. Legislation Waiving Sovereign Immunity in Tort	1-8
B.3.a. Tort Claims Acts	1-8
B.3.b. State Claims Acts	1-8
B.3.c. Highway Defect Statutes	1-9
C. THE STATE'S DUTY AND STANDARD OF CARE TO THE TRAVELING PUBLIC	1-9
C.1. The State's Duty to the Public	1-9
C.2. Requirement of Notice of a Dangerous Condition	1-11
D. INDIVIDUAL LIABILITY OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION OFFICIALS OR EMPLOYEES.....	1-12
D.1. Origins of Personal Liability	1-12
D.2. Absolute or Partial Immunity of Transportation Officials and Employees	1-12
D.3. Defenses of Public Officials and Employees	1-14
D.3.a. The Defense of Acting Under Orders	1-14
D.3.b. Discretionary-Ministerial Distinction	1-14
D.3.c. The Public-Private Duty Doctrine	1-16
D.3.d. The Misfeasance-Nonfeasance Distinction	1-16
D.4. Statutory Provisions Relating to Defense and Indemnification	1-16
D.4.a. Providing a Legal Defense	1-16
D.4.b. Indemnification of Public Officers or Employees	1-16
APPENDIX A STATE STATUTES PERTAINING TO LIABILITY AND DEFENSE OF PUBLIC OFFICIALS AND EMPLOYEES.....	1-18
SECTION 2 TRANSPORTATION ACTIVITIES THAT MAY GIVE RISE TO TORT LIABILITY	2-1
A. PLAINTIFF'S BURDEN TO PROVE CAUSE IN FACT AND PROXIMATE CAUSE	2-3
A.1. Introduction	2-3
A.2. Cause in Fact	2-3
A.3. Proximate or Legal Cause	2-4
B. WARNING SIGNS, TRAFFIC LIGHTS, OR PAVEMENT MARKINGS—INSTALLATION AND MAINTENANCE	2-7
B.1. Absence of General Duty to Install Warning Signs, Traffic Lights, or Pavement Markings	2-7
B.2. Duty to Warn of or Correct Known Dangerous Conditions	2-9
B.2.a. Warning Signs	2-9
B.2.b. Traffic Lights	2-10
B.2.c. Pavement Markings	2-11

C. DEFECTS IN THE PAVEMENT SURFACE	2-12
C.1. The Transportation Department's Duty to the Public.....	2-12
C.2. Cases Allowing and Denying Recovery.....	2-13
D. SNOW AND ICE CONTROL.....	2-13
D.1. Transportation Department's Duty Concerning Treatment of Snow and Ice Conditions	2-13
D.2. The Standard of Care for Snow and Ice Removal.....	2-15
D.3. Statutes Affecting Transportation Department's Duty for Snow and Ice Control	2-16
D.4. Liability in Eminent Domain, Trespass, or Nuisance for Snow Removal and Salting Operations	2-17
E. WET-WEATHER CONDITIONS AND SKIDDING ACCIDENTS.....	2-18
E.1. The State's Duty to Guard Against Slippery Road Conditions	2-18
E.2. Failure to Correct Hazardous Wet Weather Skidding Locations	2-19
E.3. The Effect of the Highway Safety Act on a State's Duty to Skid-Proof Highway Surfaces	2-20
F. INJURIES CAUSED BY OBSTRUCTIONS OR DEFECTS IN THE HIGHWAY SHOULDER.....	2-21
F.1. Conditions Under Which the Motorist May Lawfully Use the Shoulder	2-21
F.2. Representative Cases in which Plaintiffs Sustained Injuries on the Highway Shoulder.....	2-22
F.2.a. Drop-Off Between the Pavement and the Shoulder	2-22
F.2.b. Rut, Ditch, Hole, Depression or Other Shoulder Condition	2-23
F.2.c. Other Obstacles in the Shoulder	2-24
F.2.d. Effect of Warning Signs	2-24
G. ACCIDENTS CAUSED BY TREES OR VEGETATION IN THE RIGHT-OF-WAY OR ON ADJACENT PROPERTY	2-25
G.1. Introduction	2-25
G.2. Trees Located Within or Near the Highway Right-of-Way.....	2-25
G.3. Duty to Cut or Remove Vegetation Obscuring the Highway.....	2-27
H. DEFECTIVE OR DANGEROUS CONDITIONS ON BRIDGES AND OTHER STRUCTURES.....	2-28
H.1. The State's Duty to the Traveling Public Includes Bridges	2-28
H.2. The Maintenance of Bridge Railings	2-29
H.3. Snow and Ice Conditions on Bridges	2-30
H.4. Failure to Post Signs Warning of Structural Defects in Bridges.....	2-31
SECTION 3 DEFENSES FOR DISCRETIONARY ACTIVITY	3-1
A. IMMUNITY FROM LIABILITY BASED ON DISCRETIONARY FUNCTION OR ACTIVITY	3-3
A.1. Introduction	3-3
A.2. Federal Cases Interpreting the Discretionary Function Exemption in the FTCA	3-3
A.3. State Cases Construing a Provision in State Tort Claims Acts Exempting Discretionary Activity	3-8
B. APPLICATION TO HIGHWAY DESIGN OF AN EXEMPTION FOR DISCRETIONARY ACTIVITY	3-11
B.1. Introduction.....	3-11
B.2. Immunity for Negligent Design Based on a Statutory Exemption for Discretionary Activity.....	3-12
B.3. Arbitrary or Unreasonable Decisions or Decisions Made Without Adequate Study or Deliberation.....	3-13
B.4. Effect of Known Dangerous Conditions on Immunity	3-14
B.5. Design Immunity Statutes.....	3-14
B.6. Duty to Improve the Design Due to Changed Circumstances.....	3-15
C. APPLICATION OF DISCRETIONARY EXEMPTION TO MAINTENANCE OF HIGHWAYS	3-17
C.1. Introduction.....	3-17
C.2. The Element of Choice as the First Step in the Analysis	3-17
C.3. The Element of Policy Consideration as the Second Step in the Analysis.....	3-19
C.4. Applicability of the Discretionary Activity Exemption in Maintenance Cases Involving Known Dangerous Conditions.....	3-19

D. APPLICATION OF THE DISCRETIONARY ACTIVITY EXEMPTION TO HIGHWAY GUARDRAILS AND BARRIERS	3-20
D.1. Decisions to Provide or Not Provide Guardrails and Barriers as Protected by the Discretionary Exemption	3-20
D.2. Decisions to Provide or Not Provide Guardrails and Barriers That Are Not Discretionary.....	3-21
D.3. Railroad Crossings	3-23
E. THE DISCRETIONARY ACTIVITY EXEMPTION AS APPLIED TO TRAFFIC CONTROL DEVICES	3-24
E.1. Immunity for Decisions Regarding Whether to Provide Them.....	3-24
E.2. Immunity for Selection, Placement or Sequencing	3-24
E.2.a. Traffic Lights and Signals	3-24
E.2.b. Warning Signs or Markings	3-25
E.2.c. Stop Signs and Speed Limit Signs	3-27
SECTION 4 SELECTED TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT DEFENSES IN TORT ACTIONS.....	4-1
A. DEFENSES BASED ON ALLOCATION OF RESOURCES OR PRIORITY OF PROJECTS	4-3
A.1. The Allocation of Funds as a Defense.....	4-3
A.1.a. Decisions Recognizing the Defense	4-3
A.1.b. Decisions Not Recognizing the Defense	4-4
A.2. Evidence Required to Prove the Allocation Defense.....	4-5
A.3. The Financial Feasibility Defense.....	4-5
A.4. Priority of Highway Projects or Programs as a Defense.....	4-6
A.5. The Department's Workload as a Defense.....	4-7
B. THE PUBLIC DUTY DEFENSE TO TORT LIABILITY.....	4-8
B.1. Origin and Nature of the Public Duty Doctrine	4-8
B.2. The Public Duty Doctrine in Highway Cases.....	4-9
SECTION 5 TRIAL PREPARATION, EVIDENCE RULES, AND STRATEGIES IN TRANSPORTATION TORT LITIGATION	5-1
A. SUGGESTED TRIAL STRATEGIES AND TECHNIQUES.....	5-3
A.1. Pre-Suit Notice Requirement	5-3
A.2. The Investigative Phase.....	5-3
A.3. Reviewing the Complaint and Agency File for Potential Defenses Including Immunity	5-4
A.4. The Discovery Phase	5-6
A.5. Discoverability or Admissibility of Data Compiled for Highway Safety.....	5-7
B. ADMISSIBILITY AND USE OF UNIFORM LAWS, REGULATIONS, STANDARDS OR GUIDELINES APPLICABLE TO DESIGN AND MAINTENANCE ACTIVITIES	5-8
B.1. Sources of Applicable Highway Standards or Guidelines	5-8
B.2. Admissibility of Standards or Guidelines into Evidence.....	5-9
B.3. Standards or Guidelines as Evidence of the Standard of Care.....	5-10
B.4. Violation of a Standard or Guideline as Negligence <i>Per Se</i>	5-11
C. ADMISSIBILITY OF EVIDENCE OF PRIOR ACCIDENTS, POST-ACCIDENT REMEDIAL MEASURES, EXPERT OPINION, AND ACCIDENT RECONSTRUCTION.....	5-13
C.1. Introduction.....	5-13
C.2. Admissibility of Evidence of Prior Accidents or of Post-Accident Remedial Measures	5-13
C.2.a. Evidence of Prior Accidents	5-13
C.2.b. Admissibility of Remedial Measures Taken After the Accident.....	5-14
C.3. Admissibility of Expert Testimony and Accident Reconstruction Evidence	5-15
C.3.a. Use of Expert Testimony in General.....	5-15
C.3.b. Admissibility of Accident Reconstruction Evidence.....	5-16

D. THE TRIAL.....5-18

**SECTION 6 SHIFTING OR SHARING OF LIABILITY AMONG THE
TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT AND OTHERS 6-1**

A. PROTECTING THE TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT FROM LIABILITY 6-3

 A.1. Introduction 6-3

 A.2. Contractual Indemnity..... 6-3

 A.3. Insurance 6-3

 A.4. Statutory Limitations on Damages, Punitive Damages, and Attorney's Fees..... 6-4

B. SHIFTING LIABILITY FROM THE TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT TO OTHERS..... 6-5

 B.1. Contribution, Counterclaims, and Cross-claims 6-5

 B.2. Equitable Indemnity 6-7

 B.3. Subrogation 6-8

INDEX I-1

INDEX OF CASES..... I-9